

## INFORMED PERSPECTIVES: RACE AND RELIGION IN CHINA

1

00:00:35.640 --> 00:00:47.670

Jue Liang: Welcome everyone, thank you for joining Informed Perspectives: Race and Religion in China. Today's webinar is hosted by the Religion, Race & Democracy Lab at the University of Virginia.

2

00:00:48.420 --> 00:00:59.280

Jue Liang: I am Jue Liang, postdoctoral fellow in Asian religion and culture at Denison University and a research fellow with the Religion, Race & Democracy Lab at the University of Virginia.

3

00:01:00.630 --> 00:01:13.800

Jue Liang: This program is a continuation of the Lab's series Informed Perspectives, which brings journalists, documentarians, and humanity scholars into conversation about issues concerning religion, race and politics.

4

00:01:14.610 --> 00:01:22.770

Jue Liang: We would like to thank the Luce/ACLS Program in Religion, Journalism and International Affairs for so generously sponsoring the event.

5

00:01:24.090 --> 00:01:39.450

Jue Liang: Before introducing our guest, I would like to encourage audience members to raise questions to our event to do so, please use the Q & A function at the bottom of your screens, there will be time at the end of the event to field some of your questions.

6

00:01:40.620 --> 00:01:51.600

Jue Liang: We are recording today's webinar which will be made available on the Lab's website [religionlab.virginia.edu](http://religionlab.virginia.edu) next week, a link will also be shared with all attendees via email.

7

00:01:52.680 --> 00:01:56.910

Jue Liang: And now it is my pleasure to introduce our moderator Charles Laughlin.

8

00:02:01.290 --> 00:02:12.630

Charles Laughlin: Thank you and good evening everyone. I'm very pleased to see the great turnout for this evening's event, my name is Charles Laughlin. I'm a professor of East Asian Studies.

9

00:02:13.320 --> 00:02:21.840

Charles Laughlin: Actually, specifically I'm a professor of Chinese literature and I'm the Chair of the Department of East Asian Languages, Literatures & Cultures at the University of Virginia here.

10

00:02:22.860 --> 00:02:32.580

Charles Laughlin: I'm particularly honored to be asked to be the moderator for this tonight's conversation, although my role as moderator is basically to get out of the way of the,

11

00:02:33.180 --> 00:02:48.000

Charles Laughlin: The attendees and the panelists and facilitate your conversation. I'm honored though as a professor of modern Chinese literature, because the religious faith is an issue that is particularly.

12

00:02:50.010 --> 00:02:58.080

Charles Laughlin: untouched, I think, by modern Chinese literature and film there may be disagreement with that, but I think those exceptions proved the rule.

13

00:02:59.100 --> 00:03:08.370

Charles Laughlin: However, I have a few comments about that that we share with everybody during the conversation after our presentation so I'm moderating.

14

00:03:09.060 --> 00:03:21.090

Charles Laughlin: Ian Johnson, our first guest is a Pulitzer Prize-winning writer focusing on society, religion and history, he was awarded a 2020 2021 National Endowment for the humanities public scholars.

15

00:03:22.050 --> 00:03:31.800

Charles Laughlin: fellowship for new book he's writing on China's unofficial history, Catherine Hardie our other guests is assistant professor in the department of.

16

00:03:32.430 --> 00:03:41.430

Charles Laughlin: Translation interpreting and intercultural studies at Hong Kong Baptist University. Her research lies at the intersection of the Tibetan and Chinese cultural worlds.

17

00:03:41.970 --> 00:03:53.910

Charles Laughlin: Inside the PRC with a particular focus on contemporary Han Chinese involvement in Tibetan Buddhism so first by each of our speakers will deliver some remarks.

18

00:03:54.990 --> 00:04:04.620

Charles Laughlin: And then we'll follow that with a converse a brief conversation among ourselves, but we'll be collecting and organizing the questions that come from you all, and so at.

19

00:04:05.100 --> 00:04:13.470

Charles Laughlin: The at the end will leave plenty of time for the panelists to address your questions and now I'd like to welcome you Ian Johnson to join us.

20

00:04:17.850 --> 00:04:31.020

Ian Johnson: Okay well thanks very much everybody good morning i'm in Singapore right now and i'm going to be giving a bit of an overview lecture I guess that's why i'm i'm.

21

00:04:31.860 --> 00:04:42.150

Ian Johnson: hitting lead off to talk a little bit about the state of religion in China, especially the contemporary situation in the new era.

22

00:04:43.740 --> 00:04:55.710

Ian Johnson: So let me share with you a little PowerPoint that I have that has some nice little pictures and stuff like that.

23

00:04:56.790 --> 00:04:58.110

Ian Johnson: So.

24

00:05:00.270 --> 00:05:01.740

Ian Johnson: yeah I want to talk, first of all.

25

00:05:03.810 --> 00:05:08.070

Ian Johnson: First part of my talk is about the return of religion.

26

00:05:09.090 --> 00:05:20.220

Ian Johnson: And this is going to be super fast and and, unfortunately, you know almost with a lot of simplifications, but I think it's fair to say, I think most people would agree that.

27

00:05:20.730 --> 00:05:29.490

Ian Johnson: Starting in the mid to late 19th century there was a top down secular rising effort that began in China.

28

00:05:30.360 --> 00:05:47.460

Ian Johnson: So, in other words, led by elites who felt not without cause that China was in the midst of a catastrophic change that had challenged many, many assumptions about Chinese society faith belief.

29

00:05:48.480 --> 00:06:00.210

Ian Johnson: values, culture and that this is something maybe different than what the Chinese civilization had experienced previously, that the incursion of the West.

30

00:06:01.260 --> 00:06:13.170

Ian Johnson: signifies signified obviously the beginning by the opium wars, but that just a steady stream of of invasions and and yeah you could say humiliations, even though that for it it's been sort of appropriated by the Communist Party, but.

31

00:06:13.830 --> 00:06:21.210

Ian Johnson: that these have these challenge many, many assumptions and I think one of the things was was caused a great amount of self doubt.

32

00:06:21.750 --> 00:06:33.450

Ian Johnson: On in Chinese institutions and religion was really at the Center of this now, when we think of the standard discourses on Chinese history we normally think about.

33

00:06:34.500 --> 00:06:49.080

Ian Johnson: Various other things that took place in the 19th century, but the assault on religion was often underlying a religion and counter pushes in society were from religious groups were part of this are really at the Center of it.

34

00:06:50.460 --> 00:06:58.050

Ian Johnson: And that is because, like in many societies in the world religion was at the Center of Chinese society religious.

35

00:06:59.340 --> 00:07:03.750

Ian Johnson: religion and politics were intertwined in a way that was hard to separate.

36

00:07:05.610 --> 00:07:15.240

Ian Johnson: Present day to our calls temples the nexus of power in traditional China and so when reformers we're going after.

37

00:07:15.840 --> 00:07:22.500

Ian Johnson: Trying to change Chinese society in the 19th and 20th centuries, they realized that they couldn't just sort of.

38

00:07:22.980 --> 00:07:34.530

Ian Johnson: Which was, maybe the Emperor or something like that they had to also go after a religion so starting, even in the reforms of 1898 there was a proposal to convert.

39

00:07:35.400 --> 00:07:48.690

Ian Johnson: temples into schools, so the idea that these temples were full of sort of superstitious nonsense that was not really helping China China needed science and China needed a literate.

40

00:07:49.260 --> 00:07:57.930

Ian Johnson: population in order to strengthen itself and stand up to the West and also probably to Japan, which was coming up on the horizon, as well.

41

00:07:59.100 --> 00:08:08.550

Ian Johnson: You know which religions, am I talking about at this time, Islam was still is relatively small religion in terms of the population.

42

00:08:09.780 --> 00:08:28.590

Ian Johnson: And Christianity was not very big at a time, the major religions that they took taking him out where they sort of so called traditional religions of Buddhism taoism and a big and morpheus group of beliefs and practices that we can call folk religion so.

43

00:08:29.790 --> 00:08:39.210

Ian Johnson: And this is symbolized, for example by sun Yat Sen, who was credited with overthrowing the Ching dynasty in 1911 leading that revolution.

44

00:08:39.570 --> 00:08:54.150

Ian Johnson: When he was a young man going into the temple in his local village, with a stick and smashing a statute and saying I thought the gods were powerful and so symbolizing the deeds of just this is nothing.

45

00:08:55.740 --> 00:09:12.570

Ian Johnson: So they can T, which took over the golden dawn the Nationalist Party they continued this secularized effort, there was a new life movement and young people went out into the countryside and often tried to dismantle.

46

00:09:13.800 --> 00:09:14.640

Ian Johnson: temples.

47

00:09:15.750 --> 00:09:26.490

Ian Johnson: Religion began to be viewed as a social ill something akin to opium smoking or foot binding something that had to be solved in order for China to become a modern.

48

00:09:28.650 --> 00:09:41.760

Ian Johnson: And then obviously the campaign was not empower for very long before was engulfed by war, the invasion from Japan and civil war, and then the Communists took over, and they continued.

49

00:09:42.450 --> 00:09:52.980

Ian Johnson: This top down modernizing process and, just like the can T they began to organize religion into committees and and sort of church like structures.

50

00:09:53.310 --> 00:10:07.530

Ian Johnson: And they gave us what we have today is five official religions of China and five official religious groups, I would say Buddhism Taoism Islam and Christianity is divided into two groups Protestantism and Catholicism.

51

00:10:09.480 --> 00:10:21.150

Ian Johnson: This only lasted for a few years in the 1950s and then began what is euphemistically called 20 years of leftist excesses beginning sort of with the great leap forward.

52

00:10:21.750 --> 00:10:30.750

Ian Johnson: The anti-rights campaign and greatly forward and then sort of blending into the Cultural Revolution and only really ending with Mao's death in 1976.

53

00:10:31.920 --> 00:10:50.730

Ian Johnson: After that, when dung Xiaoping takes power and there's the reform and opening period that sort of officially, you could say, time is starting around 1978 you have a return of religion on having events my slides here.

54

00:10:52.350 --> 00:10:59.730

Ian Johnson: And this return is symbolized maybe in this picture, where more and more people began to practice.

55

00:11:00.030 --> 00:11:08.550

Ian Johnson: Religion the party's view is still that religion was a problem that religion, would go away, but instead of, say, forcing it closed and.

56

00:11:08.970 --> 00:11:21.270

Ian Johnson: They would just allow it to die a natural death, that as society progressed and we moved from socialism communism, but people become enlightened they become prosperous they become.

57

00:11:22.050 --> 00:11:34.860

Ian Johnson: better educated and they wouldn't really Neil this religious mumbo jumbo to get through the day, so I think in this sort of symbolized by this document 19 that was released, I think we need to or maybe 31.

58

00:11:36.210 --> 00:11:43.710

Ian Johnson: They foresaw religion bailout religion to come back they opened up seminaries and training.

59

00:11:45.330 --> 00:11:54.420

Ian Johnson: Facilities institute's for monks and nuns and priests, but there was no expectation that would religion would really take off.

60

00:11:55.050 --> 00:12:04.200

Ian Johnson: And yet it did take off and, as you can see, this picture is not a typical so it's a well dressed person with a Gucci.

61

00:12:04.890 --> 00:12:20.280

Ian Johnson: Gucci handbag and the temple is kind of full and you can see the scenes all around China today where religion is widely practiced despite many crackdowns which we'll get to in a minute.

62

00:12:21.900 --> 00:12:31.110

Ian Johnson: And I think that this sort of carried on more or less uninterrupted despite occasional crackdowns on house churches and underground.

63

00:12:32.190 --> 00:12:33.390

Ian Johnson: religious groups.

64

00:12:34.530 --> 00:12:47.100

Ian Johnson: On measures against a the Dalai Lama or the crackdown on the Falun Gong spiritual movement in the late 1990s this have carried on up until the.

65

00:12:48.120 --> 00:12:58.800

Ian Johnson: Late 2000s say beginning around 2010 I think it's simplistic to date all this with shooting thing taking power in 2012 there was already an expert.

66

00:12:59.220 --> 00:13:10.620

Ian Johnson: feeling that society needed to be society as a whole needed to be reined in a little bit better and that there needs to be some measures taken that that.

67

00:13:11.370 --> 00:13:20.940

Ian Johnson: The government had allowed things to sort of go too far in in civil society, as well as the region or religion being maybe part of civil society.

68



00:13:22.950 --> 00:13:29.160

Ian Johnson: So this starting with shooting thing is assumption the power.

69

00:13:30.900 --> 00:13:47.970

Ian Johnson: Just a few other pictures go through them really quickly and get to our main actor in this in this Park, the talk staging paying when he takes over in 2012 he calls for a new spiritual rejuvenation of China and.

70

00:13:49.830 --> 00:14:09.270

Ian Johnson: As symbolized by the Chinese dream, but he also began to more forcefully and explicitly endorse the so called traditional religions in China, the party still pushed model workers and model of Communist heroes like this person lay fun.

71

00:14:10.320 --> 00:14:20.520

Ian Johnson: But by it, but it also I think recognize that it needed to have a a broader message that would appeal to more more people that people like play fun.

72

00:14:21.030 --> 00:14:35.700

Ian Johnson: we're not terribly convincing they seem sort of passe but the government still realized that site and needed some sort of moral basis, and so it began to embrace not just Confucius but.

73

00:14:36.990 --> 00:14:51.960

Ian Johnson: Also, and here it actually is choosing thing and truthful in 2013 when he declares that Confucius has a lot of good things that are worth studying and worth learning and that's the two food party Secretary next to him looks like he's having a heart attack.

74

00:14:53.160 --> 00:14:57.420

Ian Johnson: And in here is meeting a prominent Buddhist.

75

00:14:58.740 --> 00:15:18.060

Ian Johnson: abbott they had a full function, which is a Taiwanese Buddhist mission mission icing organization that has been allowed to come to mainland China and open up temples libraries cultural centers and things like that and I had a chance to talk to.

76

00:15:19.380 --> 00:15:27.750

Ian Johnson: him about this also government going to push public education with an explicit moral content moral a moral content that.

77

00:15:28.440 --> 00:15:51.030

Ian Johnson: included sort of broader ideas like on the propaganda poster on the right of a cultural self-confidence but also embracing the meal confusion ideas coming from the philosopher one young man and putting this up on billboards around China and.

78

00:15:52.200 --> 00:15:56.670

Ian Johnson: I think the again this is support for some religions, such as.

79

00:15:57.690 --> 00:16:10.500

Ian Johnson: taoism Buddhism and practices like this, these kind of folk religious practices they can see many of them were declared to be superstitious in the earlier Communist era.

80

00:16:11.520 --> 00:16:21.030

Ian Johnson: Earlier residency even in the reform and opening up or in the 80s and 90s, but gradually became redefined as folk practices and this one.

81

00:16:21.600 --> 00:16:35.250

Ian Johnson: is even gets Intangible Cultural Heritage status, which is a something borrowed a term borrowed from the United Nations to allow some religions or some some practices to get financial support from the government.

82

00:16:36.630 --> 00:16:41.460

Ian Johnson: Now I want to keep my remarks very brief, so we can go into Catherine, and then have a discussion.

83

00:16:41.940 --> 00:16:54.630

Ian Johnson: But these are more shots of the of a pilgrimage outside Beijing which gets government support every year the pilgrimage itself gets support and the groups that go and perform there they're given support.

84

00:16:55.530 --> 00:17:00.900

Ian Johnson: they're not doing it for financial gain they're doing it because they have a belief, this is important than the government support.

85

00:17:01.230 --> 00:17:05.910

Ian Johnson: is more symbolic and maybe amounts to \$1,000 a year, but when you divided among.

86

00:17:06.270 --> 00:17:17.070

Ian Johnson: 30 people and have to rent a bus and buy costumes and stuff for people every year or renew them and so on and so forth, it doesn't really go very far but it's something that's that is sort of.

87

00:17:17.850 --> 00:17:25.770

Ian Johnson: An important symbolic change the idea that this is now embraced and supported by the government, and there I am spinning one after the.

88

00:17:27.060 --> 00:17:36.570

Ian Johnson: Other you can see a huge amount of temple construction going on in China, and then, finally, problems with foreign states, and I think, maybe we can leave a little bit for the.

89

00:17:37.650 --> 00:17:50.880

Ian Johnson: Q amp a session, but we have clearly a campaign that's gone on against well against Protestantism and then Islam as well, and I think the.

90

00:17:51.330 --> 00:18:08.970

Ian Johnson: uniting feature here is that these groups are seen as having too many or problematic foreign ties the Catholic Church to the Vatican Protestantism through the global Protestant community, which often supports.

91

00:18:10.440 --> 00:18:25.380

Ian Johnson: Protestants in China and Islam through the global Wilma and neighboring countries the pilgrimage to Mecca etc, and so we've seen obviously a campaign against a wagers which has an Anti Islamic element to it as well.

92

00:18:25.800 --> 00:18:35.490

Ian Johnson: And so I think this is in line with broader crackdowns on civil society against NGOs as well, so.

93

00:18:36.780 --> 00:18:49.470

Ian Johnson: I guess i'm going to just leave it here and then we'll allow Charles to come in and start a conversation and we'll move on to Catherine so thanks, very much for that.

94

00:18:51.600 --> 00:18:52.410

Charles Laughlin: Thank you very much.

95

00:18:54.060 --> 00:19:09.690

Charles Laughlin: it's hard to compress your all of the knowledge that you've gathered over such a long time to do such a brief period of time, but we appreciate the fast overview i'm from 30,000 feet now i'd like to welcome Catherine hardy to join us next.

96

00:19:13.500 --> 00:19:16.170

Catherine Hardie: Thank you, thank you very much for the introduction Charles.

97

00:19:17.790 --> 00:19:25.830

Catherine Hardie: Good afternoon, everyone i'm really glad to be here and taking part in this conversation today and Thank you everyone who's tuned in.

98

00:19:26.310 --> 00:19:38.370

Catherine Hardie: So I thought that I would take as my point of departure ian's remarks just now about the tendency of the Chinese state to favor religions that are deemed to be sinuistic.

99

00:19:38.850 --> 00:19:46.320

Catherine Hardie: and use this as a way into discussing the position ality and character of Tibetan Buddhism in the PRC today.

100

00:19:47.040 --> 00:19:59.430

Catherine Hardie: So one of the main things that were concerned with this afternoon are the entanglements of ethnicity, religion and politics in mainland China and Tibetan Buddhism provides an interesting case study.

101

00:20:00.540 --> 00:20:18.420

Catherine Hardie: The reason I say this is that with Tibetan Buddhism, we have a religion that is of non Chinese origin and with foreign ties in terms of the links between the excel community in in South Asia.

102

00:20:20.040 --> 00:20:27.930

Catherine Hardie: And a religion that in the last few decades, has made more popular inroads in Chinese society than ever before.

103

00:20:28.380 --> 00:20:38.190

Catherine Hardie: Now, to be sure Han Chinese is an officially recognized branch of PRC Buddhism, it has its own sub branch within the Buddhist association of China.

104

00:20:38.610 --> 00:20:48.840

Catherine Hardie: There are nearly 4000 legally registered Tibetan Buddhist monasteries in China and a monastic population legally registered numbering in the 10s of thousands.

105

00:20:50.130 --> 00:21:02.940

Catherine Hardie: Yet no standing it's orthodox Buddhist status Tibetan Buddhism remains and ethnic minority religion in China and by this I mean that the Chinese state defines Tibetan Buddhism as practiced.

106

00:21:03.270 --> 00:21:19.590

Catherine Hardie: Only by Tibetans and a few other geographically contiguous ethnic minorities, so official statistics for Tibetan Buddhism, as with Islam really grounded in the assumption that all members of an ethnic group are adherence to a particular religion.

107

00:21:20.610 --> 00:21:32.130

Catherine Hardie: Unofficially, or however or at a grassroots level Tibetan Buddhism, in the last two decades, or more has become an extremely active missionary religion in mainland China.

108

00:21:32.820 --> 00:21:41.640

Catherine Hardie: As the spiritual cache of Tibetan Buddhism has surged among a largely middle to upper class Chinese urban demographic.

109

00:21:42.060 --> 00:21:49.380

Catherine Hardie: A lively sign a phone Tibetan Buddhist scene has spread throughout the Chinese urban religious landscape.

110

00:21:49.950 --> 00:21:59.700

Catherine Hardie: loosely organized informal lay on Chinese patron disciple networks centered on charismatic Tibetan lamas have proliferated.

111

00:22:00.210 --> 00:22:07.200

Catherine Hardie: With mobile religious networking taking shape, as Tibetan lamas characteristic mode of religious outreach.

112

00:22:07.860 --> 00:22:23.220

Catherine Hardie: Throughout the 2010s the advent of smartphones and social networking technologies has spurred on this missionary momentum leading Tibetan Buddhism to massively expand its constituency of Chinese converts and sympathizers.

113

00:22:24.720 --> 00:22:26.310

Catherine Hardie: it's difficult to.

114

00:22:28.110 --> 00:22:31.290

Catherine Hardie: To to ascertain the precise scope of this phenomenon.

115

00:22:32.520 --> 00:22:52.140

Catherine Hardie: But unofficial estimates suggest that between several hundred thousand and up to several million Chinese people may be involved in Tibetan Buddhism now, while this might only represent a very tiny proportion of the PRC estimated total of 240 million Buddhists.

116

00:22:53.160 --> 00:22:59.550

Catherine Hardie: it's nonetheless evidence of Tibetan Buddhism considerable advances religious advances in recent years.

117

00:22:59.910 --> 00:23:10.230

Catherine Hardie: And, of course, it goes without saying that, from the perspective of a minority religion of six to 8 million adherents and increasing convert followers of this.

118

00:23:10.740 --> 00:23:28.980

Catherine Hardie: magnitude is of immense significance, and this is especially so in view of the generous financial patronage that this affluent demographic has provided for the reconstruction of tms Tibetan monastic communities during the post mal revival of Tibetan Buddhism.

119

00:23:31.140 --> 00:23:33.030

Catherine Hardie: Actually, could you please show my first slide.

120

00:23:34.590 --> 00:23:54.810

Catherine Hardie: So over the course of my research into Han Chinese involvement in Tibetan Buddhism, in the last decade, my focus has been on on this place, what has emerged in the postmodern era, as undoubtedly the most influential hub in the sign of phone Tibetan Buddhist world.

121

00:23:55.890 --> 00:24:09.600

Catherine Hardie: Its name is the Center a lot on five sciences Buddhist academy it's, better known as longer some of you may indeed have seen pictures before of it before and it's it's certainly a visually arresting side.

122

00:24:10.770 --> 00:24:12.030

Catherine Hardie: Next slide please actually.

123

00:24:13.920 --> 00:24:18.030

Catherine Hardie: Oh that's another another picture from another vantage point next slide please absolutely.

124

00:24:18.780 --> 00:24:32.010

Catherine Hardie: So just to take a look at this map, we can see that it's actually located towards the east of the Tibetan plateau in the Far West of Sichuan province now what's significant about this part of the Tibetan plateau is that in the.

125

00:24:32.550 --> 00:24:45.360

Catherine Hardie: last few decades, the restrictions on monastic Buddhism have generally been less onerous then in the Tibetan autonomous region, and this is an important factor in explaining the size to rich this institution.

126

00:24:45.990 --> 00:24:54.090

Catherine Hardie: has grown and indeed it's the autonomy that it is enjoyed for a large amount of its history.

127

00:24:54.630 --> 00:25:09.840

Catherine Hardie: Now, first and foremost longer is celebrated in Tibetan areas for its powerful role in the revival of Tibetan Buddhism, in the wake of the Cultural Revolution and as a bastion of Tibetan religious centered if no cultural identity.

128

00:25:10.890 --> 00:25:12.540

Catherine Hardie: Next slide please actually.

129

00:25:14.490 --> 00:25:15.150

Catherine Hardie: Next slide.

130

00:25:17.820 --> 00:25:18.480

Catherine Hardie: Maybe next slide.

131

00:25:19.710 --> 00:25:25.050

Catherine Hardie: Thanks, so it grew rapidly from a very small religious encampment at the beginning of the.

132

00:25:27.360 --> 00:25:33.480

Catherine Hardie: into the world's most populous Tibetan Buddhist Center of scriptural learning and practice by the 1990s.

133

00:25:33.930 --> 00:25:43.260

Catherine Hardie: Well traditionalist in its ethos it's also demonstrated significant progressiveness and innovation in a number of respects, most notably in its.

134

00:25:43.620 --> 00:25:56.550

Catherine Hardie: unprecedented commitment to educational and religious parity between male and female practitioners significantly over half of learning guys monastic community is comprised of Tibetan nuns.



135

00:25:57.810 --> 00:26:09.060

Catherine Hardie: Now, at the same time that Lauren Guy has nurtured Tibetan spiritual capital in and for Tibetan world, it has also been an unrivaled missionary fourth in Chinese society.

136

00:26:09.660 --> 00:26:21.090

Catherine Hardie: The momentum began in the late 1980s and early 1990s, when Lauren Guy's founding teacher decided to establish a division in his Community 400 Chinese practitioners.

137

00:26:21.450 --> 00:26:32.910

Catherine Hardie: which grew over time and put longer on the map as a rare hospitable Sino-Tibetan Buddhist community on the Tibetan plateau next slide please.

138

00:26:35.790 --> 00:26:50.490

Catherine Hardie: These are some pictures from the Tibetan some does it longer next slide please actually Yes, this is a picture from 1992 of the early Han Chinese sangha at at at longer.

139

00:26:51.990 --> 00:27:00.450

Catherine Hardie: So of course there's a lot of history to be told around the development of this community at large on gabbert blip and its.

140

00:27:01.260 --> 00:27:05.760

Catherine Hardie: impact on the wider spread of Tibetan Buddhism in mainland China but.

141

00:27:06.570 --> 00:27:14.940

Catherine Hardie: Let it suffice to say for now that the second generation Tibetan two disciples of the founding member of this institution.

142

00:27:15.300 --> 00:27:28.140

Catherine Hardie: expanded on his missionary engagement of Han Chinese audiences primarily through the utilization of the Internet to teach labeled as about Tibetan Buddhism in the Chinese language next slide please.

143

00:27:30.570 --> 00:27:41.880

Catherine Hardie: So these pictures from longer of Han Chinese laborers to have flocked there to take part in an annual dharma assembly.

144

00:27:43.350 --> 00:27:52.680

Catherine Hardie: And when, in normal circumstances, this is a generally an event that 10s of thousands of practitioners from India and China attend.

145

00:27:54.390 --> 00:28:03.960

Catherine Hardie: And, in fact, such as the missionary progress, you might say that longer are made through the 2010s that one of its.

146

00:28:04.470 --> 00:28:11.400

Catherine Hardie: Leading teachers in particular achieved considerable fame as an Internet religious liberty in Chinese society.

147

00:28:12.360 --> 00:28:19.080

Catherine Hardie: But if we zoom back out from longer now to consider the missionary footprint of Tibetan Buddhism in.

148

00:28:19.890 --> 00:28:31.290

Catherine Hardie: China as a whole, one might reasonably ask what has been the attitude of the Chinese state towards Tibetan Buddhism expanded religious influence in China problem.

149

00:28:32.250 --> 00:28:44.850

Catherine Hardie: And I think it's important or indeed essential to point out in this connection that china's religious policies generally prohibit Tibetan lamas from disseminating religion beyond their home ethnic regions.

150

00:28:45.390 --> 00:28:54.840

Catherine Hardie: And furthermore, just like all religious professionals in China, they are restricted by law from proselytizing outside legally authorized premises.

151

00:28:55.230 --> 00:29:02.250

Catherine Hardie: So this means when they travel to mainland China, the fact that they lack a State sanctioned institutional base from which to operate.

152

00:29:02.520 --> 00:29:08.700

Catherine Hardie: deprives their outreach activities of legal status and leaves them open to suppression at any time.

153

00:29:09.030 --> 00:29:16.770

Catherine Hardie: So, as a consequence of these restrictions as scholars, such as ellison denton Jones and dance my you have noted.

154

00:29:17.130 --> 00:29:29.670

Catherine Hardie: Most Tibetan lamas travel to and stay in Chinese cities in a private capacity and engage with followers in private spaces so unlike in North America, there are no open to the public Tibetan.

155

00:29:30.000 --> 00:29:54.300

Catherine Hardie: Buddhist dharma centers or organizations in Chinese cities now or you can end this year, thank you Ashley for the greater part of the last three decades, however, this paradigm of outreach has proved quite viable periodic crackdowns on group activities, of course, have not been uncommon.

156

00:29:55.500 --> 00:30:04.080

Catherine Hardie: But to the degree that Tibetan Buddhist teachers and they have Chinese lane networks have remained domestically based and financed loosely organized.

157

00:30:04.380 --> 00:30:14.010

Catherine Hardie: and careful to steer clear of Tibetan exile related politics their existence until recent times has been broadly tolerated by authorities.

158

00:30:14.940 --> 00:30:29.370

Catherine Hardie: Most fieldwork and formats, I know, however, would concur that the missionary golden age of we might call it that, of the mid 2010s which was bullied on by the relatively unregulated state of Chinese cyberspace has now passed.

159

00:30:30.270 --> 00:30:38.910

Catherine Hardie: The extent to which this is due to a specific targeting of by the authorities of Tibetan Buddhism overstepping its boundaries.

160

00:30:39.210 --> 00:30:49.530

Catherine Hardie: or to the more general tightening of restrictions on religious life and civil society and Internet usage under the sheet administration is is difficult to say.

161

00:30:50.700 --> 00:30:58.920

Catherine Hardie: Nevertheless, in the eyes of many Chinese Buddhist practitioners and their Tibetan lamas, this is a highly disappointing development.

162

00:30:59.190 --> 00:31:11.400

Catherine Hardie: Many had watched the overall thrust of Chinese state discourse on buddhism's role in mainstream Han Chinese society become more positive and accepting throughout the 2000s.

163

00:31:11.850 --> 00:31:24.690

Catherine Hardie: Well Tibetan Buddhism in meshed as it is in volatile geopolitics and sensitive issues of ethnic minority governance and painted by associations of primitive nervous and superstition.

164

00:31:25.050 --> 00:31:30.840

Catherine Hardie: has had been marginalized from these concentric conceptions of positive Buddhism.

165

00:31:31.290 --> 00:31:45.030

Catherine Hardie: Tibetan Buddhism is growing profile in Chinese society in the 2010s was interpreted by many as a tentative sign of increasing top down, recognition of Tibetan Buddhism mainstream legitimacy.

166

00:31:45.840 --> 00:31:51.870

Catherine Hardie: Now, while it seems that she didn't pins formal requirement that Tibetan Buddhism, like other religions.

167

00:31:52.230 --> 00:32:06.090

Catherine Hardie: must sign a size in order to meet the standards of political orthodoxy while it would seem that this suggests that Tibetan Buddhism remains delegated or has been relegated to the status of a.

168

00:32:07.500 --> 00:32:10.080

Catherine Hardie: Foreign linked board land religious tradition.

169

00:32:10.680 --> 00:32:24.690

Catherine Hardie: i'd like to point out that on a grassroots level, at least in the hearts and minds of hundreds and thousands of ordinary Chinese practitioners throughout China and beyond Tibetan Buddhism is more beloved and familiar than ever.

170

00:32:25.380 --> 00:32:27.900

Catherine Hardie: And I just like to leave with the opposite.

171

00:32:28.440 --> 00:32:42.510

Catherine Hardie: end with the observation that when one compares this situation to Islam, which is a similarly ethnic, religious tradition that seems very, very few hundred Chinese converts The difference is striking.

172

00:32:42.900 --> 00:33:00.180

Catherine Hardie: So when we compare the position ality of Tibetans and we, because in the contemporary PRC as we might find ourselves doing it's worth bearing in mind this avenue of cultural integration that exists in the former case, but not in the latter, thank you very much.

173

00:33:03.210 --> 00:33:17.010

Charles Laughlin: Thank you, Catherine, and thank you all for beginning to write in questions we have another almost 45 minutes in our session today and so we'd like to start off.

174

00:33:17.910 --> 00:33:33.990

Charles Laughlin: Just by discussing a few issues amongst ourselves here, one thing I see that is really nice in the balance between Ian and katherine's presentations are that end it's got this vast comprehensive overarching view of the.

175

00:33:35.160 --> 00:33:46.860

Charles Laughlin: The resurgence of religious faith of all different kinds in China over the last say 2535 years, whereas Catherine is looking at a very specific phenomenon.

176

00:33:47.580 --> 00:33:56.850

Charles Laughlin: And yet I think in catherine's very specific phenomena and you get a lot of very broad general themes, the relationship between the grassroots level.

177

00:33:57.480 --> 00:34:06.480

Charles Laughlin: I think interest in Tibetan Buddhism among Chinese I think is largely initially a grassroots interest word of mouth friends.

178

00:34:07.170 --> 00:34:22.140

Charles Laughlin: Things like that, and this is something that I think in in his book 2017 book souls of China also relies upon a great deal as a methodology right it's talking to people who are doing things in their own local communities.

179

00:34:23.400 --> 00:34:24.480

Charles Laughlin: And, and only.

180

00:34:25.650 --> 00:34:38.100

Charles Laughlin: distantly viewing government intervention or or suppression, as the case may be, or support as, as the case may also be one of the things that struck me about his book is relates to this idea of.

181

00:34:39.120 --> 00:34:43.920

Charles Laughlin: What do we mean when we say religion, because he has a section where he's talking about how.

182

00:34:44.970 --> 00:34:46.170

Charles Laughlin: Global like.

183

00:34:47.370 --> 00:34:53.220

Charles Laughlin: Statistics on religion in China are are skewed by the fact that.

184

00:34:54.570 --> 00:35:02.490

Charles Laughlin: pollsters who are unfamiliar with Chinese culture will ask questions that will lead people to say things about their beliefs.

185

00:35:03.120 --> 00:35:12.390

Charles Laughlin: That indicate that they are not religious and they don't have a spiritual life when that in fact it's not the case, and so this is one of the ways in which I think what's great about us.

186

00:35:13.560 --> 00:35:27.840

Charles Laughlin: And, and also, I think, relates to the Tibetan interest into that and Buddhism along Han Chinese is is this sense of you know what people need and how it satisfied, not necessarily fitting into a euro American idea.

187

00:35:28.170 --> 00:35:34.020

Charles Laughlin: Of what religion is and what religious practices, I wonder if each of you could comment on that first.

188

00:35:37.560 --> 00:35:38.250

Ian Johnson: Maybe go first.

189

00:35:41.640 --> 00:35:53.220

Ian Johnson: Okay, I mean, I would say that China in some ways, I think, Chinese people are very similar to to Western people in that, but for different reasons there's a.

190

00:35:54.810 --> 00:35:59.670

Ian Johnson: Mistrust or a skepticism about quote unquote organized religion that.

191

00:36:01.050 --> 00:36:20.730

Ian Johnson: that many people will say that they have faith and belief, but that they don't want to necessarily follow one religion, you know in Chinese its own gel and so they'll use these things kind of as part of a smorgasbord of belief and ideas and I don't mean to belittle this in any way, but.

192

00:36:21.780 --> 00:36:32.670

Ian Johnson: And maybe Tibetan Buddhism Kevin can you know can say what you think about this right, it feels like Lisa the people i've met and talked to was part of this.

193

00:36:34.110 --> 00:36:40.020

Ian Johnson: You know palette of beliefs and ideas, many of the people who went to that pilgrimage site showed pictures of.

194

00:36:40.830 --> 00:36:58.170

Ian Johnson: they'd also driven their cars or or jeeps to Tibet, you know, an hour flown up there and and circulated holy mountains and done stuff like that you know and then and maybe had a little Tibetan Buddhist prayer wheel hanging in their car mirror.

195

00:36:59.670 --> 00:37:07.620

Ian Johnson: But it wasn't necessarily they were like the most pious Tibetan Buddhists, or that they certainly didn't care about the Dalai Lama or spend.

196

00:37:08.220 --> 00:37:15.450

Ian Johnson: Culture on a deeper way, but they used it in some way to sort of reminded me of people in in America and maybe the this isn't so much the case anymore, but.

197

00:37:15.750 --> 00:37:22.140

Ian Johnson: Because I think there's more sensitivity toward cultural appropriation and stuff like that, but you know who would say oh I you know i'm a believer and.

198

00:37:23.010 --> 00:37:34.830

Ian Johnson: You know native American practices and and and I, you know do this, that or the other thing or and they you know dabble in a little bit of Zen Buddhism on the side and write haikus and you know.

199

00:37:35.610 --> 00:37:45.180

Ian Johnson: do a little bit of calligraphy isn't like that it again people find meaning and however they want to i'm not judging it but i'd be very sort of modern idea that I can pick and choose stuff.

200

00:37:46.530 --> 00:37:53.130

Ian Johnson: And maybe celebrate Passover seder and then also you know, do something Eastern or something like that.

201

00:37:54.600 --> 00:38:07.830

Ian Johnson: So that, in that sense of a Chinese people in Western people are part of this may post modern society where beliefs and values and stuff right sort of fungible so that would be my initials.



202

00:38:08.400 --> 00:38:13.590

Charles Laughlin: Those are some great examples I think there has been actually in the American public.

203

00:38:14.610 --> 00:38:20.580

Charles Laughlin: Maybe not quite as prominent now as it had, as it was, maybe 15 years ago an interest in Tibetan Buddhism.

204

00:38:21.630 --> 00:38:36.180

Charles Laughlin: Among let's say, like the the young, like some rock and roll hip hop Community things like that, and it kind of fulfills that rolling, and this is not to make light of it, because I think what you're talking about and I think what is relevant to this discussion is.

205

00:38:37.230 --> 00:38:39.840

Charles Laughlin: The fact that there are needs that are not being met.

206

00:38:40.920 --> 00:38:48.870

Charles Laughlin: In people's lives and in the Chinese case in the mainland Chinese case this this failure to meet needs is largely the responsibility of.

207

00:38:49.320 --> 00:38:52.890

Charles Laughlin: You know socialist culture and what you talked about at the beginning of your talk of the.

208

00:38:53.580 --> 00:39:05.400

Charles Laughlin: Not only the Communist Party and the PRC but this long Arc since the 19th century, of a kind of assault on on traditional religions, creating a vacuum right that um.

209

00:39:06.060 --> 00:39:14.190

Charles Laughlin: That all kinds of different things come into to fill before you comment on that, though, I want to see what Catherine has to say about the original question.

210

00:39:15.930 --> 00:39:33.060

Catherine Hardie: I yeah Thank you Ian and Charles I look I would probably agree with what Ian had to say, as a general phenomenon, except, I think that what you do find in among Chinese followers of Tibetan Buddhism, and perhaps you know, a greater.

211

00:39:34.380 --> 00:39:45.900

Catherine Hardie: Yes, a much greater influence of normative and orthodox Buddhism, and so the concept of being an inherent of Buddhism being taking refuge calling oneself a Buddhist.

212

00:39:46.770 --> 00:39:52.440

Catherine Hardie: That being your exclusive religious identity is much more prevalent.

213

00:39:52.890 --> 00:40:06.390

Catherine Hardie: And certainly given that Lauren Gar itself is really I mean a touchstone you might say, of orthodoxy in the Tibetan Buddhist world, this is something that is you know strongly emphasized in that community.

214

00:40:06.900 --> 00:40:20.310

Catherine Hardie: Now what that actually means, though, in terms of people's practices, I think, is another thing and I, you know from the point of view that they are, we are all participants, as you point out in a you know.

215

00:40:21.390 --> 00:40:42.720

Catherine Hardie: In a postmodern you know condition, I think that there are there is still quite a lot of combining quite still a lot of availing oneself from a broader cultural palette at the level of practice, you know at the level of identity, though my observation is very much a tendency.

216

00:40:44.040 --> 00:40:49.110

Catherine Hardie: Among Chinese followers of Tibetan Buddhism, at least committed followers.

217

00:40:50.250 --> 00:41:00.000

Catherine Hardie: To certainly to to to call oneself to identify as a Buddhist and that might not necessarily be a Tibetan Buddhist generally indeed.

218

00:41:00.600 --> 00:41:11.670

Catherine Hardie: Most people have an idea of that you know, being a Buddhist means that you know that you can make use of the resources of different traditions and so therefore.

219

00:41:12.000 --> 00:41:24.510

Catherine Hardie: And that is indeed taught by many Tibetan Buddhist teachers, as well as a strong sort of ecumenical flavor you might say, among many Tibetan Buddhist teachers outreach efforts in China.

220

00:41:26.010 --> 00:41:27.600

Catherine Hardie: So.

221

00:41:28.890 --> 00:41:37.710

Catherine Hardie: But, of course, you know I think we've as in any religious you know, culture or community or seeing you're going to have people who are highly committed.

222

00:41:38.610 --> 00:41:48.510

Catherine Hardie: And then you're going to have you know, a continual gradation of people whose commitments, perhaps less intense and then for more likely to.

223

00:41:49.530 --> 00:41:54.330

Catherine Hardie: Maybe you know order their identity or distribute their religious life in.

224

00:41:55.050 --> 00:42:08.520

Catherine Hardie: You know in different kinds of ways, and so I you know, and certainly very much I think look, I think the other thing in in Tibetan areas, you know Tibet in general in bodies, a certain to a spiritual alou or for a very wide.

225

00:42:10.170 --> 00:42:27.390

Catherine Hardie: category or a wide class of Han Chinese urban people, not just for Buddhist as such, and so I do think that many people do partake of Tibet spiritual culture, whether that be through pilgrimage practices or tourism or.

226

00:42:28.770 --> 00:42:44.370

Catherine Hardie: You know, certain accoutrements using certain a Christian months and that kind of thing without you know, really, without necessarily feeling that they might even have to call themselves a Buddhist that it's sort of again part of that palette of resources that they might make yourself.

227

00:42:45.360 --> 00:42:59.460

Charles Laughlin: A certain detail i'm curious about for Catherine, is whether you have looked at the Han Chinese engagement with Tibetan Buddhism, in comparison with Han Chinese engagement with other strains of Buddhism like China or Zen Buddhism.

228

00:43:01.950 --> 00:43:10.170

Catherine Hardie: And my awareness of that is pretty much limited to my reading of secondary materials.

229

00:43:11.430 --> 00:43:23.460

Catherine Hardie: And, but I mean one thing I would say is that, when we look at just the statistics, I mean of course there are official estimates of the scale of Han Chinese participation in Tibetan Buddhism, clearly this is this.

230

00:43:23.940 --> 00:43:25.680

Catherine Hardie: You know it's Of course I guess.

231

00:43:26.220 --> 00:43:38.670

Catherine Hardie: If it's let's just say it's two or 3 million people that's really by I don't know Western standards, still a lot of people and it is a lot of people relative to the number of Tibetan Buddhists, in China, but visa V, the wider so called Buddhist.

232

00:43:39.390 --> 00:43:44.070

Catherine Hardie: population in China to you know it's a drop in the ocean, at the same time, though.

233

00:43:44.610 --> 00:44:04.710

Catherine Hardie: I think there is an argument to be made that potentially Han Chinese followers of Tibetan Buddhism, are more committed Buddhists and that 200 million figure that is thrown around refers to people whose affiliations, with our involvement in Buddhism can be quite diffuse.

234

00:44:06.330 --> 00:44:16.440

Catherine Hardie: And so I think that to make a fair comparison, it would be necessary to compare committed Chinese.

235

00:44:16.980 --> 00:44:34.140

Catherine Hardie: Followers of Buddhism, perhaps you know with with masters, who connect themselves with particular monastic institutions or have you know lay teachers or monastic teachers, whatever it may be, in any case committed followers with and and sort of, I feel that that sort of.

236

00:44:35.130 --> 00:44:47.730

Catherine Hardie: might be a sort of a fair basis on which to draw a comparison, because I think that you've just got far more diversity and a far greater spectrum of ways of doing what isn't being Buddhist among that you know that huge population.

237

00:44:48.840 --> 00:44:57.540

Charles Laughlin: yeah I asked that sort of because anecdotally over the years and Chung do, for instance i've noticed a great increase in activity at the winter UN.

238

00:44:58.170 --> 00:45:06.390

Charles Laughlin: Which is a non Tibetan Buddhist monastery but I wasn't sure what to make of it, whether it was a reflection of real.

239

00:45:07.530 --> 00:45:11.430

Charles Laughlin: spiritual engagement in religious faith or if it's just kind of like a.

240

00:45:12.600 --> 00:45:18.930

Charles Laughlin: A a popular sort of focus of new attention.

241

00:45:20.730 --> 00:45:24.240

Charles Laughlin: Because what I saw a lot of was plaques that were put up.

242

00:45:25.380 --> 00:45:36.030

Charles Laughlin: thanking donors basically for contributing to the expansion and and and remodeling of this major you know Buddhist temple in Chengdu.

243

00:45:36.540 --> 00:45:44.670

Charles Laughlin: which, in a way to me reminds me of some of what he is talking about his book sort of a return to forms of religious practice.

244

00:45:45.120 --> 00:45:57.270

Charles Laughlin: which are not entirely matters of the soul right it's also a matter of re re situated in the Community and redefining cultural identity and things like that among on Chinese.

245

00:45:59.730 --> 00:46:09.060

Catherine Hardie: yeah I mean I look, I think, in general, those practices are also very observant observable in in Chinese involvement in Tibetan Buddhists, to a lot of patronage of.

246

00:46:10.110 --> 00:46:21.810

Catherine Hardie: donations to monastic communities and so very much you know, taking upon oneself the role of a pious lay supporter of the monastic community.

247

00:46:22.680 --> 00:46:26.880

Catherine Hardie: The idea of you know accumulating merit, you know of karmic recompense.

248

00:46:27.750 --> 00:46:38.370

Catherine Hardie: You know, lay subjectivity is piety all of these things I think they're equally observant there, I think, the one thing I will say is and this specifically relates to longer but.

249

00:46:39.150 --> 00:46:45.840

Catherine Hardie: it's not exclusively something that's only found it longer one of the complaints that many.

250

00:46:46.350 --> 00:46:56.130

Catherine Hardie: Chinese people have when they potentially cross over to Tibetan Buddhism from initial exposure to Chinese Buddhism, is that they have not found sufficiently.

251

00:46:57.120 --> 00:47:04.830

Catherine Hardie: Challenging or spiritually rewarding modalities of religious engagement often to them.

252

00:47:05.460 --> 00:47:12.540

Catherine Hardie: You know at monasteries and that they have been engaged as lay supporters when they have that you know they have a desire to study.

253

00:47:12.780 --> 00:47:28.860

Catherine Hardie: You know, for I guess you know for for rigorous spiritual practice to study text to learn meditation methods to sit oneself on the path to enlightenment and that's a very, very strong discourse, certainly in among the Chinese community of lay followers that centered on our own.

254

00:47:30.510 --> 00:47:40.650

Charles Laughlin: Thank you i'm looking at the time here I just had one other topic to cover before we go over to the on attendee questions was sort of shift from Buddhism Christianity, so I suppose it will be more.

255

00:47:41.760 --> 00:47:47.400

Charles Laughlin: ian's area, although if Catherine has had us on this i'm interested in it, because I think the opening.

256

00:47:48.570 --> 00:47:50.520

Charles Laughlin: remarks that Ian made maybe.

257

00:47:51.750 --> 00:47:58.080

Charles Laughlin: covered the Christian experience in China, less than the Buddhist Dallas and confusion piece.

258

00:47:58.920 --> 00:48:11.850

Charles Laughlin: But the the Christian experience, both as a part of modern Chinese history, and also as a part of the resurgence of religious faith in China is substantial right, and I think it's a really interesting aspect of.

259

00:48:13.620 --> 00:48:14.190

Charles Laughlin: The research.

260

00:48:17.010 --> 00:48:35.010

Ian Johnson: yeah well Christianity was really quite small and China has a long history and it has had a permanent presence in China for about 400 years since mikael richie arrived, but it was a lot, it was quite small until.

261

00:48:36.060 --> 00:48:44.220

Ian Johnson: The 19th century than the influx of missionaries, but even then I would say 1949 there only about 1 million Protestants and 3 million Catholics and.

262

00:48:44.610 --> 00:48:53.340

Ian Johnson: I saw somebody in the question and answer areas question about with all the system, and I can just say that I think since 1949 Catholicism.

263

00:48:53.910 --> 00:49:06.570

Ian Johnson: has just track population growth, and so there are roughly 10 million Catholics in China today, so that has been a problem which is so complicated and.

264

00:49:07.470 --> 00:49:17.730

Ian Johnson: want to get into, but it has also to do with why the Vatican aging in this overreach to the Communist Party and trying to you know work with them and rebuilding the clergy, but.

265

00:49:18.360 --> 00:49:36.060

Ian Johnson: But Protestantism really took off from 1 million followers to today, you know the I would say I was going for lower estimates, but sort of 40 5060 million something there clearly Protestantism and I think this fits into.

266

00:49:37.350 --> 00:49:45.780

Ian Johnson: The idea that when you've had cultural dislocation that these global mission icing religions, often can come in very strongly.

267

00:49:46.500 --> 00:49:54.720

Ian Johnson: there's a sociologist in Beijing, the founders and work on model atheist counties in China their model atheists counties.

268

00:49:55.200 --> 00:50:04.890

Ian Johnson: model atheist counties in the mouth era and then overlaid Protestantism over that, and you can see the explosion of Protestantism in those counties, because the.



269

00:50:05.310 --> 00:50:20.280

Ian Johnson: Traditional religious or infrastructure is kind of destroyed and it's like clear cutting a forest, you know, and the new something new, will come up and maybe in some ways, this is what Tibetan Buddhism i'm just speculating but maybe it offers this by having these kind of.

270

00:50:21.330 --> 00:50:39.870

Ian Johnson: Clear ritual structures it's something that that appeals to people, I mean I don't know but but but it strikes me that what is appealing, often in a time of uncertainty are are things that are very certain or are structured as Falun Gong offered that also 20 years ago.

271

00:50:41.100 --> 00:50:42.540

Ian Johnson: and Christianity today.

272

00:50:44.160 --> 00:50:55.440

Charles Laughlin: Thank you i'm just to do justice to the number of questions rolling in from the attendees I think i'm going to switch over to that now, and so I have a first question really good question, I think, for both of you.

273

00:50:56.580 --> 00:51:09.180

Charles Laughlin: With the developments in the whole range of issues in this region area era of China, do you think religious governance in China is returning to the time the Cultural Revolution, what are the parallels and what is different from that era.

274

00:51:17.130 --> 00:51:18.360

Catherine Hardie: Would you like to study in.

275

00:51:19.140 --> 00:51:25.440

Ian Johnson: Okay, well, I want to say, probably no it's not going back to the Cultural Revolution it's probably trying to go back with a lot of things and changing thing.

276

00:51:25.830 --> 00:51:36.420

Ian Johnson: happening he's trying to go back to his father's era, you know the early to mid 1950s, when the Communist Party was full of upgrade motivated members and they sort of have this structure of.

277

00:51:37.050 --> 00:51:52.950

Ian Johnson: Five religious groups and everybody was a member of them are supposed to be a member of that of them and have a party lead society but it didn't it didn't you know, in the mail era, especially in that 20 year period from the late 50s mid to late 50s until he died.

278

00:51:54.060 --> 00:52:12.210

Ian Johnson: Religion became more and more persecuted until there's basically no public religious life and there's not that's not face today, I mean there's still there's still religious life in China it's just harder and harder to have unregistered especially unregistered churches or mosques.

279

00:52:13.410 --> 00:52:21.450

Ian Johnson: And anything that has size or scale, so if it's really just the host church that kind of thing it's still Okay, but if you try to have a big.

280

00:52:21.720 --> 00:52:30.240

Ian Johnson: And there were many of these mega churches that had hundreds of members and seminaries and kindergartens and stuff like that they were not registered with the government, they were.

281

00:52:30.600 --> 00:52:38.310

Ian Johnson: underground, but they had hundreds of those sort of things are being closed, so I think it's an effort to reassert control, but not to go back to the revolution.

282

00:52:39.720 --> 00:52:40.260

Charles Laughlin: Catherine.

283

00:52:41.370 --> 00:52:47.220

Catherine Hardie: um you know I would agree with that, I think the certainly something I have witnessed in.

284

00:52:48.330 --> 00:52:55.560

Catherine Hardie: You know, in the Tibetan way well at least among Chinese followers of Tibetan Buddhism, yes, certainly this idea that.

285

00:52:56.400 --> 00:53:11.850

Catherine Hardie: Excessive organizational presence has been repressed, and so there is this idea that, to the extent that one is loosely organized in formal practice is largely private and it's tolerated but organizations as such.

286

00:53:12.300 --> 00:53:23.340

Catherine Hardie: will not be you know of course that's difficult for people from the point of view that organizations are what you know mediate between the private and the public, there you know part of religious life so that's you know experienced is.

287

00:53:23.790 --> 00:53:28.830

Catherine Hardie: extremely disappointing and upsetting and I will, though I think the.

288

00:53:29.880 --> 00:53:45.270

Catherine Hardie: salient like a really necessary thing to point out is or exception to that is is what we've been saying is obviously what's happening in xingjiang at the moment, which I think we could only describe as a return to condition something of that nature.

289

00:53:46.680 --> 00:53:47.490

that's a very good.

290

00:53:48.870 --> 00:53:49.080

Ian Johnson: yeah.

291

00:53:50.820 --> 00:53:57.780

Charles Laughlin: I just want to make one more comment, I went to Catherine said, because I think what's really interesting about the case of Han interested in Tibetan Buddhism.

292

00:53:58.050 --> 00:54:06.630

Charles Laughlin: Is that it has this very productive and interesting tension between government control or suppression or governance of religion, on the one hand and popular.

293

00:54:06.960 --> 00:54:16.440

Charles Laughlin: Interest, on the other hand, which are, it seems like things would have turned out somewhat differently if there wasn't this broad Han Chinese interest in Tibetan Buddhism.

294

00:54:16.860 --> 00:54:23.670

Charles Laughlin: And it might in fact look more like King John into bed, although I'm, not to say that things are rosy in Tibet, either.

295

00:54:24.540 --> 00:54:33.420

Charles Laughlin: But, but this there's an m m vigilance going on, that I think is quite interesting, which is, I think, supported also by the overall.

296

00:54:34.050 --> 00:54:49.770

Charles Laughlin: resurgence of interest in religious faith, so I think the question is motivated by comparison which didn't bring to Chairman Mao, which is a little bit inaccurate and not to speak in defensive she didn't think, but the emphasis he puts on.

297

00:54:51.900 --> 00:54:57.690

Charles Laughlin: spiritual life or the life, you know it seems to in his case.

298

00:54:58.890 --> 00:55:11.370

Charles Laughlin: be giving him a way to work with Confucianism given away to work with Buddhism, that that is not so much the head had not been so much the experience of the socialist or what we call them our era.

299

00:55:12.780 --> 00:55:16.050

Charles Laughlin: Moving ahead, though, another really good question.

300

00:55:16.800 --> 00:55:26.010

Charles Laughlin: Specifically, I think, for alarm guard but also maybe you might have something to say about this, and that is how has the coconut pandemic impacted activities of our own gar.

301

00:55:26.310 --> 00:55:36.900

Charles Laughlin: what's it like currently and then whether he has something to say about religious practice in general and China's observes, whether he knows it there being any impact on religious practice.

302

00:55:37.980 --> 00:55:38.400

Catherine Hardie: huh.

303

00:55:39.810 --> 00:55:51.240

Catherine Hardie: yeah as far as I know, the beginning of the pandemic so back in January, February last year when covert the covert outbreak took place in China that there was.

304

00:55:52.770 --> 00:56:01.770

Catherine Hardie: A very concerted effort, maybe sort of similar to what took place during size to keep it out of minority areas.

305

00:56:03.810 --> 00:56:05.400

Catherine Hardie: Due to the fact that.

306

00:56:06.510 --> 00:56:27.750

Catherine Hardie: hygiene conditions are more challenging demographic issues you know compound that and so local guy was placed under pretty strict lockdown and that went, you know as we're villages right across Eastern Tibet so and, indeed, not just decent to bit, but the whole of China.

307

00:56:28.950 --> 00:56:39.120

Catherine Hardie: As far as I know that you know that really went through until you know April May, June when things were considered to be relatively safe again.

308

00:56:40.560 --> 00:56:57.810

Catherine Hardie: And then, more or less religious life has returned to normal, presumably, with some element of you know, compulsory mask wearing and and you know, perhaps some other protocols, as well as far as I know, that's a situation.

309

00:56:59.460 --> 00:56:59.700

Charles Laughlin: yeah.

310

00:57:01.080 --> 00:57:12.780

Ian Johnson: yeah that's what I think is the case, also from what I know I mean I keep a big test for my in world that I call it will be the sort of big pilgrimage is coming up in.

311

00:57:13.920 --> 00:57:14.430

Ian Johnson: May.

312

00:57:15.540 --> 00:57:23.880

Ian Johnson: And I think last year, the pilgrimage like to malfunction that that mountain that I showed him the slideshow at the end it was close it was not allowed.

313

00:57:24.720 --> 00:57:28.350

Ian Johnson: This year it's supposed to be allowed with, but I think you're going to have to.

314

00:57:28.770 --> 00:57:42.090

Ian Johnson: register ahead of time if you're going, and they have an online registrations they're trying to limit the number of people going so you don't get the 10s of thousands going in the day that you would have on the first day of this festival.

315

00:57:43.560 --> 00:57:57.750

Ian Johnson: And you know that the open question is whether these things become normal and that later this is sort of an excuse to implement all these things, and then later, you just keep them out of safety or fire prevention or something like that you know and.

316

00:57:59.310 --> 00:58:05.250

Charles Laughlin: yeah the question resonated with my memory, I was in Taiwan at the time, so I don't know how it's covered in the media elsewhere in the world.

317

00:58:05.460 --> 00:58:10.740

Charles Laughlin: But one of the really disastrous and shocking moments in the early weeks of the pandemic was in Korea.

318

00:58:11.070 --> 00:58:22.110

Charles Laughlin: There was a religious organization, where they had a super spreader event that made the Korean case loads just just rocket up and it really was viewed as a as a crisis, although.

319

00:58:22.740 --> 00:58:37.650

Charles Laughlin: It flew over in a few weeks, and now, Korea, I think it's still being hailed as one of the countries that is handling the pandemic particularly well, so I think at this point in time and then it's over a year old, and I think, each country has a better idea of how to.

320

00:58:38.820 --> 00:58:49.500

Charles Laughlin: How to move back into normal practices in a safe way but it's probably going to never go back to what it was before next question.

321

00:58:50.340 --> 00:58:59.430

Charles Laughlin: Here in the US Christian nationalism, especially in the last four to five years has become the new religious frame that bears racial implications.

322

00:58:59.940 --> 00:59:11.160

Charles Laughlin: In China, deploying a new Confucianism to build nationalistic sentiments and what about China's deployment of Confucianism and how much definitely discourses involved in that process.

323

00:59:13.350 --> 00:59:24.060

Ian Johnson: Well, I know it's a big city here Catherine's from how this plays out into bed or any certain areas, but I feel that the.

324

00:59:25.200 --> 00:59:45.540

Ian Johnson: Government overall is pushing a sort of Han Chinese version of traditions and that so many of the things that you see as being you know traditional culture or as they would say you know you show the bit beneficial or the excellent sides of traditional culture.

325

00:59:46.680 --> 00:59:55.320

Ian Johnson: are often you know Han Chinese culture, and so I think that the potential there is that it further alienates ethnic minorities in China, I mean I don't think we're.

326

00:59:55.950 --> 01:00:05.400

Ian Johnson: at a point where you have confusion fundamentalists who are have a you know, a political party or something that isn't like the BJP and China.

327

01:00:06.060 --> 01:00:09.930

Ian Johnson: Maybe fast forward 30 years and it will be life after 20 years but.

328

01:00:10.710 --> 01:00:22.380

Ian Johnson: I do think that there is sort of though an exclusivity that what's being defined as the norm is is Han Chinese culture and then everything else is kind of an outlier with maybe like a few things thrown in from.

329

01:00:22.980 --> 01:00:29.430

Ian Johnson: You know other other cultures, but not not not significantly engaging with them, so I guess that's what I see the risk in there.

330

01:00:30.570 --> 01:00:39.840

Charles Laughlin: yeah it's interesting because I think Confucianism can be mobilized as a kind of nationalist this course, it reminds me of the new LIFE movement in the 1930s, which was.

331

01:00:40.560 --> 01:00:46.530

Charles Laughlin: sort of intellectual pushback from the golden dawn against the leftism of the Communist Party.

332

01:00:46.830 --> 01:00:55.140

Charles Laughlin: In the 1930s, which used a lot of confusion values and, of course, the history of the golden dawn in the Republic of China has continued to Center itself.

333

01:00:55.470 --> 01:01:11.400

Charles Laughlin: On at least in the golden dawn version on on Confucian values and then again so and for somebody who studies the period before 1949 and literature, for example, it seems odd to see the leader of the PRC.

334

01:01:12.390 --> 01:01:27.960

Charles Laughlin: Expressing some kind of interest in reverence for confusion legacy and confusion values when that was precisely what the Communist Party was trying to overturn and destroy and grew out in its in its heyday that's just my comment.

335

01:01:29.310 --> 01:01:47.340

Charles Laughlin: For cat at Tibetan Buddhist centers outside the Tibetan autonomous region like lauren gar or at your goal in Beijing are clerics forced to recognize political Tibetan holidays, such as serfs emancipation day on march 28 This is something i'm unfamiliar with.



336

01:01:50.160 --> 01:01:54.780

Catherine Hardie: So i'm not sure about the situation that you're going in Beijing, but.

337

01:01:56.490 --> 01:02:08.190

Catherine Hardie: And you know what I think it would be actually quite difficult to generalize about the situation across Eastern Tibet as far as learning gary's concerned for a very long time, they enjoyed.

338

01:02:08.640 --> 01:02:21.540

Catherine Hardie: You know so much autonomy really over how they ran their institution days of that nature were not observed and to the extent I would imagine that they received a notification from.

339

01:02:22.590 --> 01:02:36.990

Catherine Hardie: Perhaps the religious Bureau or the united front that they should observe observe that it was perhaps given I don't know some really kind of the most basic sort of lip service imaginable such that are barely registered registered report on the on the population.

340

01:02:38.040 --> 01:02:39.990

Catherine Hardie: That was the case there then.

341

01:02:42.030 --> 01:02:52.560

Catherine Hardie: As to how things will be moving forward, and you know I can't say I can't comment on that, and you know, and I, I think that one thing that has emerged.

342

01:02:53.760 --> 01:03:03.060

Catherine Hardie: You know from studies of monastic communities across the eastern Tibetan era in the last decade or two is that.

343

01:03:04.320 --> 01:03:11.370

Catherine Hardie: The restrictions and the level of intervention on specific religious communities varies actually quite a bit.

344

01:03:11.820 --> 01:03:30.030

Catherine Hardie: And so it may be the place, for example, it may be the case, for example, that a monastery that has been quite problematic in a political sense and is therefore been subject to quite a lot of control and restriction and intervention is then subject to these you know requirements.

345

01:03:32.010 --> 01:03:36.360

Catherine Hardie: yeah that's really the best I can say about that.

346

01:03:36.930 --> 01:03:44.070

Charles Laughlin: Just as a point of clarity for me, especially when you say Eastern Tibet are you referring to that Tibet areas trying to.

347

01:03:45.090 --> 01:03:48.330

Charles Laughlin: Gansu province and Ching Ching hai included in that or.

348

01:03:48.450 --> 01:04:03.300

Catherine Hardie: Yes, exactly so basically all of the Tibetan areas that fall under the administration of the neighboring provinces of the Tibetan autonomous region so that's Ching hai danseuse which one and and you nonprofits to.

349

01:04:04.230 --> 01:04:11.880

Charles Laughlin: Okay, thank you um there's a question actually God is done us a favor and combine three questions for both of you.

350

01:04:12.840 --> 01:04:24.630

Charles Laughlin: And it looks really interesting I have seen reports of renewed actions against Buddhist practices in China recently just in the last six months, for example, statues and murals being covered up, either by concrete or paint.

351

01:04:24.990 --> 01:04:35.970

Charles Laughlin: Can your pine about how widespread the seams and what the shift and CCP sentiment might be for the continuing growth of Buddhist practices of China there's a couple follow up questions i'll just leave it at that, for now.

352

01:04:37.410 --> 01:04:37.920

Catherine Hardie: i'm.

353

01:04:39.060 --> 01:04:44.490

Catherine Hardie: Certainly in Tibetan areas, there has been a campaign over the last couple of years to.

354

01:04:46.290 --> 01:04:56.250

Catherine Hardie: Remove public symbols of you know overt conspicuous symbols of Buddhism and i've you know i've witnessed this everywhere.

355

01:04:57.480 --> 01:04:59.190

Catherine Hardie: And you know it is.

356

01:05:00.210 --> 01:05:09.180

Catherine Hardie: And it varies, you know i've seen, for example, money stones, which are basically stones that Tibetans, you know in brave sacred letters onto.

357

01:05:09.270 --> 01:05:19.230

Catherine Hardie: painted over black paint you know i've seen other pictures where other cases were huge immense Buddha statues, you know, maybe.

358

01:05:20.910 --> 01:05:28.410

Catherine Hardie: I you know i've actually I was going to say meters, but nobody knows meters like very retold any race and have.

359

01:05:29.100 --> 01:05:41.970

Catherine Hardie: been you know, the local authorities have demanded that they be covered up and so there's you know being huge scaffold things built around them to cover them so didn't know they don't observable from a distance, and when I asked people.

360

01:05:42.600 --> 01:06:00.570

Catherine Hardie: About this, the general response is this is the result of overzealous local government governments responding to directives from above, so they receive directives that you know tell them that they're you know that they shouldn't.

361

01:06:01.230 --> 01:06:08.130

Catherine Hardie: have an overly Buddha sized or you know religious symbols in public, and then they really take that far.

362

01:06:08.400 --> 01:06:23.820

Catherine Hardie: and part of that is a fear from getting in trouble is they don't do the right thing, or it could be, on the other hand, a desire to get in the right books of someone by you know really taking things to the ultimate limit but yes, this is this happens, a lot.

363

01:06:26.220 --> 01:06:26.490

Charles Laughlin: yeah.

364

01:06:28.470 --> 01:06:31.830

Ian Johnson: I mean, I would say in a hand areas there are many.

365

01:06:33.180 --> 01:06:33.900

Ian Johnson: Examples of.

366

01:06:35.160 --> 01:06:45.930

Ian Johnson: Buddhist some taoist folk religion, you know temples being occasionally torn down and there was a big one in statue that you know these are usually.

367

01:06:47.190 --> 01:06:55.650

Ian Johnson: declared you have any legal illegal construction and I always see is sort of more in the context in the Han areas is being.

368

01:06:56.040 --> 01:07:11.790

Ian Johnson: A symbolic counterweight to the tearing off of crosses, and so they can say oh it's not just against Christianity Look, we also tore down this hope religion temple overindulge young you know and they've occasionally over the years over the decades they tear down these temples.

369

01:07:12.900 --> 01:07:20.490

Ian Johnson: Because they proliferate and then the government sort of comes in, like sort of like a weed whacker into the knocks them back, and then they get rebuilt again.

370

01:07:21.750 --> 01:07:30.060

Ian Johnson: And so I tend to think is more like that, rather than a stain campaign against Buddhism taoism or folk religion.

371

01:07:31.290 --> 01:07:36.960

Ian Johnson: In a way, that it is against say Christianity and Islam, but I may be wrong.

372

01:07:38.550 --> 01:07:53.700

Charles Laughlin: Thank you um there's a question for me and Catherine i'm not sure why, for me, but the question is did the golden dawn continue their secular rising mission in Taiwan any thoughts on how religious life and development in Taiwan and Hong Kong overall track.

373

01:07:55.350 --> 01:07:58.770

Charles Laughlin: Overall, compared to contemporary China, I would just say for.

374

01:08:00.240 --> 01:08:03.360

Charles Laughlin: If the secular rising mission of the can T and.

375

01:08:04.800 --> 01:08:25.230

Charles Laughlin: in Taiwan is refers to the use of confusion discourse to draw people away from other kinds of faith or religious practices that are considered superstitious or somehow otherwise harmful to society, I think that's part of the past, I think.

376

01:08:26.250 --> 01:08:37.350

Charles Laughlin: there's two sides to this one is that Okay, the golden dawn continued to ruin in Taiwan as a kind of a totalitarian regime until 1986 when the martial law was lifted.

377

01:08:38.040 --> 01:08:51.900

Charles Laughlin: Freedom of the press was instituted and there began to be democratic elections, certainly after that point in time, religious life in Taiwan is extremely free and open, no matter what your religion is there's a lot of evidence of very.

378

01:08:53.010 --> 01:09:09.240

Charles Laughlin: vibrant religious activity of confusion type Buddhist Christian Jewish Islamic and so I would say absolutely noted to that question um any other comments on that Catherine, since it was also addressed it.

379

01:09:10.260 --> 01:09:14.730

Catherine Hardie: um I mean I would agree with with with.

380

01:09:16.260 --> 01:09:21.450

Catherine Hardie: With what you say in terms of the you know the Buddhist revival, I guess.

381

01:09:23.340 --> 01:09:35.970

Catherine Hardie: in Taiwan, and you know, by extension, Hong Kong, although cohen's really the power Center for it, you know Hong Kong, really, really trails trails fire and its weight in terms of that.

382

01:09:38.640 --> 01:09:48.360

Catherine Hardie: has played such a huge role actually in leading the Buddhist revival in in mainland China and there's, not only in Chinese my honor in terms of.

383

01:09:49.170 --> 01:10:04.530

Catherine Hardie: Well, I mean everything you know modeling ways of organizing you know modeling ways of practice establishing social connections all of that sort of thing it's also you know supplied models and inspiration to.

384

01:10:05.610 --> 01:10:18.090

Catherine Hardie: Tibetan Buddhist teachers and groups in terms of their outreach in in in land China to I mean they looked at as just being such a successful and inspirational missionary.

385

01:10:19.110 --> 01:10:30.570

Catherine Hardie: You know paradigms, whether it be in terms of their utilization of mass media formats, you know the cohesiveness of their organizations, the bureaucracy ization of their organizations.

386

01:10:31.980 --> 01:10:41.850

Catherine Hardie: it's made a very significant impact on the development of well Buddhism or Buddhist organization in in the mainland to.

387

01:10:43.020 --> 01:10:52.500

Charles Laughlin: i'm glad to use that opportunity to speak to what is in Hong Kong, because you are in Hong Kong and Hong Kong Baptist university it didn't seem to me anecdotally i've seen.

388

01:10:53.130 --> 01:11:06.450

Charles Laughlin: Christianity, it has very strong institutional footprint in in Hong Kong, at least until well remains to be seen what's what's to become about, but it seems to be very much a part of the DNA of the Hong Kong and, as we know it.

389

01:11:07.230 --> 01:11:15.270

Charles Laughlin: we're running out of time here, but there is like one other question that's around there's two questions that have been highlighted on this move down to the next one.

390

01:11:16.440 --> 01:11:16.950

Charles Laughlin: So.

391

01:11:18.210 --> 01:11:23.730

Charles Laughlin: yeah mostly for cat in has some way to weigh in here.

392

01:11:24.960 --> 01:11:28.950

Charles Laughlin: Then please do three questions with regard to Chinese followers of Tibetan Buddhism.

393

01:11:29.670 --> 01:11:40.770

Charles Laughlin: How to Hong Kong Chinese followers fit into this social and communal aspect of Tibetan Buddhist monasteries and religion, are there any traces of institutionalization of practices within those groups.

394

01:11:41.640 --> 01:11:55.320

Charles Laughlin: In form of creating tsonga informal dharma groups etc among Han Chinese who have recently embraced Tibetan Buddhism has their relationship to the State or the Communist Party changed, how do they contend with the politics of Tibetan Buddhism.

395

01:11:57.960 --> 01:12:00.150

Catherine Hardie: yeah they're they're all really great questions.

396

01:12:01.260 --> 01:12:02.940

Catherine Hardie: Regarding the first one.

397

01:12:06.390 --> 01:12:09.030

Catherine Hardie: So I would say that there is really a continuum.

398

01:12:10.170 --> 01:12:23.040

Catherine Hardie: In the extent to which one Chinese practices practitioners are you know accommodated in Tibetan Buddhist institutions in Tibetan areas and.

399

01:12:23.490 --> 01:12:36.240

Catherine Hardie: The vast majority in the vast majority of cases Han Chinese followers perhaps make occasional visits during the summer months attend prayer festivals or dharma assemblies that are organized.

400

01:12:37.290 --> 01:12:46.230

Catherine Hardie: Perhaps an audit practitioner might stay a little bit longer but generally speaking their link with Tibetan Buddhism is centered on the lama and not the institution.

401

01:12:46.530 --> 01:12:57.630

Catherine Hardie: And so, in a very meaningful way we really should I mean I think it's accurate to describe the spread of Tibetan Buddhism in mainland China is primarily taking place in in a in a.

402

01:12:58.350 --> 01:13:11.130

Catherine Hardie: Non institutional way, having said that that's, not to say that institutions have been dormant forces and Larrocha is you know, a prime example of a place that has.

403

01:13:12.090 --> 01:13:21.960

Catherine Hardie: incorporated a Han Chinese sangha fully institutionalized fully educationally accommodated ritually accommodated they have their own dharma assembly.

404



01:13:22.920 --> 01:13:28.320

Catherine Hardie: treasure teachings were revealed by the founding teacher of the Community, especially for the benefit of fun Chinese.

405

01:13:28.980 --> 01:13:37.920

Catherine Hardie: practitioners and so that would be you know really far end of the year of the spectrum of highly integrated institutionalized.

406

01:13:38.160 --> 01:13:46.830

Catherine Hardie: presence of Han Chinese practitioners in a Tibetan Buddhist community, to the extent that I think it would be accurate to call our own Gareth Sino Tibetan Buddhist community.

407

01:13:47.430 --> 01:13:58.950

Catherine Hardie: There are other places, I mean your chin God, which is another big religious community in eastern Tibet Chinese practitioners have had a very noticeable long term Community presence for.

408

01:14:00.810 --> 01:14:03.960

Catherine Hardie: You know a number of decades, a couple of decades to.

409

01:14:05.880 --> 01:14:10.440

Catherine Hardie: And then there are smaller places around the place but generally speaking.

410

01:14:11.910 --> 01:14:17.880

Catherine Hardie: Generally speaking, the relationship of Han Chinese follow it centers on the llama rather than the monastery.

411

01:14:18.360 --> 01:14:29.940

Catherine Hardie: And then regarding the relationship of Han Chinese people hundred and his followers who come to Tibetan Buddhism their relationship between their newfound faith and the politics of the Chinese state.

412

01:14:31.530 --> 01:14:44.610

Catherine Hardie: We know this is an interesting one, I think, generally speaking, most Chinese practitioners, you know don't see themselves as political becoming to Tibetan Buddhism for spiritual reasons.

413

01:14:47.010 --> 01:14:57.540

Catherine Hardie: They find themselves frustrated with the Chinese state, to the extent that it represses Tibetan Buddhism so from the point of view that.

414

01:14:58.260 --> 01:15:16.140

Catherine Hardie: This is a feel and under justified religious repression, they don't construe that, in the same way, I suppose, as Tibetans do which as simultaneously a religious repression but also a repression of their culture, cultural and ethnic identity.

415

01:15:17.730 --> 01:15:29.460

Catherine Hardie: In so far as those issues of cultural and ethnic and political identity are concerned, most Chinese practitioners either keep out of them, or they.

416

01:15:30.480 --> 01:15:39.450

Catherine Hardie: don't hear about them, that much because they're largely discussed in the Tibetan language speech community and they don't migrate so much into the.

417

01:15:40.050 --> 01:15:52.050

Catherine Hardie: Chinese you know discourse fear that's one thing and, of course, though I mean, I think you know either one interesting example I think is is again longer which.

418

01:15:54.030 --> 01:16:12.120

Catherine Hardie: has been subject to several quite traumatic demolition campaigns throughout its history and the last one took place between 2016 and 2017 and during that period, thousands of people were evicted the houses were demolished and.

419

01:16:13.170 --> 01:16:32.790

Catherine Hardie: This talk with something that was known about registered you know seen whether in person or through photos by many, many thousands of Han Chinese practitioners around China who consider that to be their spiritual home, and I think in that situation that there was.

420

01:16:35.700 --> 01:16:45.480

Catherine Hardie: Again, I think you know a lot of upset about the fact that this was taking place, but at the same time, a feeling that there was nothing that they could do about it.

421

01:16:48.030 --> 01:16:49.740

Catherine Hardie: I would say that that is.

422

01:16:52.260 --> 01:16:58.560

Catherine Hardie: Generally speaking, what I what what i've what i've observed, having said that you know, there is.

423

01:16:59.190 --> 01:17:03.900

Catherine Hardie: You know, increasingly or not, increasingly, but through over the years i've noticed that.

424

01:17:04.110 --> 01:17:16.290

Catherine Hardie: As you know, Chinese people are not coming to Tibetan Buddhism, to find out about Tibetan history to find out about Tibet and political subjectivities and ethnic grievances, but in the course of their hanging out and.

425

01:17:16.800 --> 01:17:23.370

Catherine Hardie: You know, being part of this religious community over the years, they find out things they hear things and I do find that their.

426

01:17:24.330 --> 01:17:32.460

Catherine Hardie: subjectivity is to shift interestingly over the time certainly new spaces of empathy are opened up and while that might not mean that.

427

01:17:33.060 --> 01:17:46.260

Catherine Hardie: Han Chinese practitioners political you know sensibilities mirror or map directly onto those of a typical ethnic Tibetan Nevertheless, I think that there is, there is a movement that does take place.

428

01:17:47.040 --> 01:17:57.990

Charles Laughlin: Thank you, I throw heavy and complicated question at you, and you have this beautiful um I especially like how you talked about how different speech communities, create our factor.

429

01:17:59.370 --> 01:18:06.150

Charles Laughlin: And so we're a little over time, so I wanted to toss the microphone back to in to see if he had.

430

01:18:07.350 --> 01:18:14.970

Charles Laughlin: Any overall sort of summary comments to make or or or response to this specific question.

431

01:18:17.850 --> 01:18:33.270

Ian Johnson: No, I mean, I think I think this is a really interesting time for observing religion in China, there is a clear effort by the government to rein it in, and to make it fit more closely into government priorities.

432

01:18:34.140 --> 01:18:40.740

Ian Johnson: But it remains to be seen, I think how how Clearly this will take place, and I think there's a tendency in general to look at China.

433

01:18:41.160 --> 01:18:54.090

Ian Johnson: And the government as as being all powerful and you know the name of that book The perfect dictatorship and sort of able to do everything at once, but I think religion is one of those areas that's this harder to manage and that.

434

01:18:55.080 --> 01:19:02.490

Ian Johnson: it's a good paradigm for looking at how effective the state can be in implementing institution.

435

01:19:04.020 --> 01:19:06.360

Charles Laughlin: that's that's a terrific ending.

436

01:19:07.470 --> 01:19:22.620

Charles Laughlin: And I think I want to thank all of you who've stayed up to this point we've gone over time, but most of you have stayed with us, we had a lot more questions than we were able to ask, but we had.

437

01:19:24.030 --> 01:19:30.060

Charles Laughlin: Julian assistance in prioritizing some of them, and I think we covered a lot of different areas.

438

01:19:31.800 --> 01:19:39.480

Charles Laughlin: very effectively, so I want to apologize for any of you may be waiting to have your your question address, and it was not done, but I appreciate.

439

01:19:40.050 --> 01:20:01.110

Charles Laughlin: your interest in this event, and I also want to again thank Catherine hardy for joining us, as well as in Johnson for this this excellent event and encourage you all to stay tuned to the the lab here for further events of this type.

440

01:20:05.430 --> 01:20:05.910

Ian Johnson: Thank you.

441

01:20:06.780 --> 01:20:08.220

Catherine Hardie: Thank you, Charles Thank you.

442

01:20:09.390 --> 01:20:10.440

Charles Laughlin: yeah we're gonna come back.

443

01:20:15.060 --> 01:20:23.130

Jue Liang: Yes, thank you, Catherine Thank you Ian and thank you, Charles for engaging us today and with your thoughtful commentary and the discussion.

444

01:20:23.820 --> 01:20:33.630

Jue Liang: And, I'd like to thank our audience for your questions and your participation, we hope you will also join us again on Tuesday April 6th for the next program in our series.

445

01:20:34.170 --> 01:20:48.960

Jue Liang: A conversation inspired by Anthea Butlers' new book *White Evangelical Racism: The Politics of Morality in America*. For more information, please go to [religionlab.virginia.edu/events](http://religionlab.virginia.edu/events). Thank you.